

The California State University

Bakersfield • Chico • Channel Islands • Dominguez Hills • East Bay • Fresno • Fullerton • Humboldt
Long Beach • Los Angeles • Maritime Academy • Monterey Bay • Northridge • Pomona • Sacramento
San Bernardino • San Diego • San Francisco • San Jose • San Luis Obispo • San Marcos • Sonoma • Stanislaus



Telephone: (562) 951-4020
Fax: (562) 951-4949

Board of Trustees

Ex Officio Members

Edmund G. Brown, Jr.
Governor

Gavin Newsom
Lt. Governor

Anthony Rendon
Speaker of the Assembly

Tom Torlakson
*State Superintendent
of Public Instruction*

Timothy P. White
Chancellor

Appointed Members

Adam Day
Chairman

Lillian Kimbell
Vice Chair

Silas H. Abrego

Jane W. Carney

Rebecca D. Eisen

Douglas Faigin

Debra S. Farar

Jean Picker Firstenberg

Wenda Fong

Juan Fernando Garcia

Emily Hinton

Jack McGrory

Thelma Meléndez de Santa Ana

Hugo N. Morales

John Nilon

J. Lawrence Norton

Romey Sabalius

Lateefah A. Simon

Christopher Steinhauer

Peter J. Taylor

Faculty Trustee's Report

CSU Board of Trustees Meeting – Sept. 11-12, 2018

Hereby I respectfully submit a summary of the Board of Trustees meeting. My report is largely based on the agenda materials provided to the trustees, on my personal notes from the meeting, and on my memory.

I tried my best to accurately reflect the deliberations, and I hope to have quoted correctly and paraphrased in the spirit of the speakers' and presenters' intentions. If you notice any inaccuracy or misrepresentation, please let me know (Romey.Sabalius@sjsu.edu).

Since the primary audience of this report is the faculty of the statewide academic senate (ASCSU), the focus is stronger on educational policies, legislative matters, state appropriations, and comments from the public than on other BoT agenda items.

If you do not have enough time to digest the full report, you can just review the deliberations of the committees that interest you. Alternatively, you can quickly glance at my bold highlights, which try to emphasize the most pertinent issues.

Romey Sabalius
Faculty Trustee

San José, CA – Sept. 27, 2018

Faculty Trustee's Report

CSU Board of Trustees Meeting: Sept. 11-12, 2018

On Sept. 11 and 12, the CSU Board of Trustees meeting was held at the Chancellor's Office of the California State University at 401 Golden Shore in Long Beach, California.

1. The **Board of Trustees** met on Tuesday morning in **Closed Session** to discuss Executive Personnel Matters. On the following day, it was announced in Open Session that Evelyn Nazario will replace Vice Chancellor for Human Resources Melissa Bard, who resigned effective October 1 due to family matters.
2. The **Committee on Collective Bargaining** met in **Closed Session**.
Note: The Faculty Trustee is excused from deliberations of the Collective Bargaining Committee.

The **Public Meeting** started on Tuesday, Sept. 11 at 10:30 with a moment of silence to commemorate the victims of 9/11, which include members of the CSU family.

3. The **Committee on Educational Policy** began with Public Comments. Several students criticized the executive salary increases (3%) granted at the Board meeting in July, when at the same time students suffer from housing and food insecurity. They questioned why CSU leaders, who earn yearly salaries between $\frac{1}{4}$ and $\frac{1}{2}$ million dollars, need cost of living adjustments, and they bemoaned that cuts always are made to the lower layers of campuses and not at the top. Several students also complained about being "tokenized" and called for the CSU to be serious about inclusion and diversity.

Representatives from the California Faculty Association (CFA) pointed out that with the help of activism of the union, the CSU received more funding to increase enrollment and to hire more faculty. They also claimed that "tenure-density is the best recipe for graduation," but that the \$25 million earmarked by the legislators to increase tenure-density are not distributed to campuses for that purpose.

- a. The committee received a Report on International Education. Leo Van Cleve, Assistant Vice Chancellor for International Programs and Summer Arts, illustrated the five segments of international education offered in the CSU:
 - International Collaborations: the 23-year-old relationship between the CSU and the German state of Baden-Württemberg was presented as a successful example for student exchange and faculty collaboration. Several thousand students from both countries have taken part in this bilateral academic exchange agreement over the years. Not part of the report, but included in the agenda were other examples of faculty interactions with institutions of higher learning in Egypt and Georgia.
 - International Students: **approximately 20,000 visa students are enrolled in the CSU, which constitutes about 4% of the entire student population. Over 40%**

of international students come from China and India, followed by Saudi Arabia and Kuwait and then other East Asian countries and Germany.

- International Alumni: the CSU has more than 100,000 alumni living abroad. In recent years, staff at the Chancellor's Office and campus presidents have made an **increased effort to engage international alumni**, especially in the Far East (Hong Kong and Taiwan).
- Faculty Development: as an example of a successful faculty development initiative, a week-long seminar in Ghana was featured that included 21 faculty members from 16 CSU campuses.
- Study Abroad: **almost 10,000 CSU students study abroad**. The Office of International Programs at the Chancellor's Office coordinates **62 programs in 18 countries**. Additionally, there is a **multitude of international exchanges and collaborations initiated and run by campuses**. Classes taken at international universities count towards graduation and financial aid is applicable.

In the long discussion that ensued, Trustee Sabalius lamented that despite the vast study-abroad opportunities offered by the CSU system and by campuses, **only 2% of our students** avail themselves of that possibility. Study-abroad is a proven "high-impact practice," and in addition to the curricular benefits, the experience abroad leads to growth in the students' independence, adoptability, and maturity. Sabalius further pointed out that **of the 10,000 students approximately 2/3 study abroad for only a few weeks during the summer or winter break, while only 0.5% study a semester abroad and a mere 0.2% for a whole year**. Sabalius recommended that information on study-abroad possibilities should be made an integral part of student advising from freshmen orientation throughout their studies, for example when devising road maps to graduation. He further suggested to include the number of students who study abroad as a benchmark when evaluating campus success.

Trustee Taylor questioned why, despite the proximity, the CSU does not attract more students from Mexico. The Chancellor's Office (CO) explained that Texas offers in-state tuition for students from Mexico and that the high cost of living in California is also a deterrent.

Trustee Eisen wondered why 4 of the 5 top destinations for study-abroad were in Europe *[the question remained unanswered; however, in my opinion it is a choice based on language and proximity: 1. Spain (lang.), 2. Italy (program is taught in English), 3. UK (lang.), 4. Mexico (lang. + proximity), 5. Germany (intensive and decade-long collaboration)]*.

Trustee Simon asked about equity in study-abroad. She would like to know who is eligible and who is accessing these great opportunities. The CO responded that separated equity analyses for students who study abroad are not done, but could be parceled out at request. *[Campus presidents attend all Board of Trustees meetings in open session; however, they do not speak during the meetings unless they are on the agenda or are called upon – after the meeting, the president of San Diego State explained that the large majority of students who study abroad are in fact minorities, whose proportion even exceeds the overall diversity of the campus population]*.

Trustee Fong asked whether study-abroad delays graduation. It does not by design (since all credits are transferrable), but in practice, students might study a semester or a year longer. Trustee Sabalius remarked earlier that such a delay is well worth the educational gain and growth in personality, and that if the CSU takes student success seriously, it should not impede such “high-impact practices” in the desire to increase the four-year graduation rate.

Trustee Nilon inquired whether students are not admitted to the CSU because of the costs to provide an international experience for some students. The CO responded that study-abroad is financed by tuition or self-support. There is, however, the administrative overhead for the Office of International Programs.

Trustee Morales wondered if recently there were problems with the issuance of visas for international students. The answer was “no” as far as the CO knows; however, the number of applicants has gone down in the last year.

- b. The committee received a report on *Research, Scholarship, and Creative Activities*, presented by Ganesh Raman, Assistant Vice Chancellor for Research. “The CSU is distinctive in California for utilizing this high-impact practice with undergraduate students,” thereby “providing significant interactions between faculty and students, fostering mentorships and resulting in enhanced retention rates.” Involving undergraduate students in faculty research provides them with a cutting-edge education, increases their campus engagement, and prepares them for their career or graduate studies. “From 2013-18, CSU faculty authored 37,570 journal publications, the majority of which included student coauthors.”

CSU Research and Sponsored Programs have contributed close to \$600 million yearly in federal and non-federal funds in an approximate 2/3 to 1/3 ration. Many research projects address immediate needs of the communities. Josue Duque, a student at Monterey Bay, spoke about his collaborative research on sustainable farming practices; and Craig Clements, Associate Professor for Meteorology and Climate Science at San José State University, presented his fire weather research, which after the many wildfires in northern California this year brought extensive media attention to his scholarly work.

In addition to research conducted on each individual campus, the CSU has research centers and affinity groups that span multiple campuses:

- Agriculture Research Institute
- Council on Ocean Affairs, Science and Technology
- CSU Program for Education and Research in Biotechnology
- California Desert Studies Consortium
- CSU Institute for Palliative Care
- Moss Landing Marine Laboratories
- Ocean Studies Institute
- Social Science Research and Instructional Council
- Water Resources and Policy Initiatives
- Climate Change Research Community

- Mellon Mays Undergraduate Fellowship Program

At the conclusion of the presentation, Trustee Carney wanted to know how many undergraduate students are involved in research. The CO cannot measure that number accurately, because not all student research activities are reported to the CO. However, in a survey, 33% of CSU students responded that they were actively participating in research projects.

- c. The committee received a report on the *Graduation Initiative 2025*. The initiative to increase degree completion rates and eliminate equity gaps enters its third year. **“Effective fall 2018, the CSU no longer requires students to take non-credit-bearing prerequisite courses before enrolling in college-level, credit-bearing courses. These prerequisites have historically been referred to as remedial or developmental education courses.” “Effective summer 2019, students assigned to the Early Start Program will be placed in college-level, credit-bearing courses with academic support attached to – or embedded in – the course.”**

Trustee Sabalius asked how the CSU measures the additional tenure-track positions created with the \$25 million earmarked for this purpose by the legislators. The CO responded that it distributes these funds to the campuses, but that it does not track whether or how many extra hires are completed. Campuses are required to show progress towards the GI 2025 goals, which subsequently will be reported by the CO to the Board and to the legislature.

Trustee McGrory remarked that **students who willingly study part-time bring graduation rates down. However, these results may reflect the culture of the campus, and not the diligence and achievements of the students.**

4. The **Committee on Finance** began with *Public Comments*. A representative of the CSU Employees Union (CSUEU) criticized the hiring of outside consultants when staff can do the job. Leaders of the California Faculty Association (CFA) demanded more transparency about the money entrusted to the CSU. One speaker reminded the Board that students and faculty lobbied for state allocation, and they lamented that the funds are used to increase executive salaries. Another speaker complained that the funding request by the Board does not reflect the true needs of the CSU and that the trustees should be “less modest” in their request, because it is not enough “to just get by.” Furthermore, the CSU received \$120 million from the legislators to enroll additional students, but instead of affording broader access, “the money is being directed towards making already enrolled students to take more units, whether they can handle it or not.” Another non-affiliated speaker asserted that “the CSU has a management problem, not a financing problem,” and he wondered how the use of the funds allocated to campuses is controlled [the same speaker addressed all committees, airing financial mismanagement and audit accusations by citing various cases].

The Committee was updated on the *Planning for the 2019-2020 Operating Budget* by the Chancellor's Office.

- The economic outlook continuous to be positive. It is expected that state revenues will grow by 3.1 percent in 2019-2020. Furthermore, "the state is in an excellent fiscal condition ... and already equipped with a large rainy day fund."
- Over the past 6 years, the CSU has been underfunded by a total of over ½ billion dollars.
- A multi-year budget model would be desirable to provide longer-term financial sustainability and planning.
- "Unlike in the past several years, the state legislature's and next governor's funding commitment is not know at this time."
- The systemwide academic facilities deferred maintenance backlog is estimated at \$3.7 billion.

To cover cost increases, negotiated salaries, facilities and infrastructure needs, and to fund enrollment growth as well as priority projects (Graduation Initiative 2025), the CO anticipates a budget request of \$446 to \$528 million, depending on the size of the envisioned enrollment increase (3% to 5%). This would be a recurring augmentation to the CSU's operating budget of \$6.7 billion. In addition, the CO suggests to ask for one-time funds in the amount of \$15 million for the CSU Basic Needs Initiative (to address students' housing and food insecurity as well as mental health needs) and for \$150 million for facilities.

Trustee Nilon thanked the CO for being "bolder" in their proposed budget request, referring to Lieutenant Governor Newsom's urging the trustees at the Board meeting in May to ask the legislature for what the CSU really needs. Trustee Taylor opined that the \$15 million request for the Basic Needs Initiative should be an on-going base budget allocation and not just a one-time disbursement; a point that was supported by Trustee Hinton and McGrory later in the discussion.

Trustee Sabalius expressed satisfaction that the proposed budget augmentation plan is higher than last year's request (\$283 million). However, he believes that the one-time funds of \$150 million for facilities is much too low to address the CSU's deferred maintenance costs of \$3.7 billion, which –if unaddressed– grows by several hundred million dollars every year. Furthermore, aging facilities and infrastructure create increasing security risks. Therefore, Sabalius suggested that the Board should ask the legislators to provide \$1 billion in one-time funding to seriously address our deferred maintenance needs. Ideally, the CSU would ask for \$1 billion every year for the next four years, corresponding to the full cost of our deferred maintenance backlog. He reminded the Board that a budget request is also a form of communication to the legislators and to the public what the real needs of the CSU are.

Trustee McGrory agreed that the Board should ask for more and not less. Yet, he would prefer a \$3-\$4 billion general obligation bond with the debt-service to come from the state. Over the course of the discussion, several trustees stressed the importance of a multi-year funding commitment from the legislature.

5. The **Committee on Campus Planning, Buildings and Grounds**
 - a. approved the San José State University Interdisciplinary Science Building. President Papazian presented the project and explained that it was the first academic building at SJSU in 30 years that will be built from the ground up (the last one being the Engineering Building). The \$181 million building received the third and final approval by the Board. This prompted Trustee Taylor's question whether the Board must approve every building three times. The CO's answer was affirmative, and that public-private partnerships even require additional approvals.
 - b. The committee received an overview of the Preliminary Five-Year Capital Plan, which includes **298 infrastructure improvement projects, 120 academic projects, and 95 self-support projects with a total cost of \$16 billion**. This level of funding "exceeds the multi-year financing authority approved by the Board of Trustees in November 2016. The trustees may be asked in November 2018 to consider approval of additional capital funding and financing."
6. The **Committee on Audit** received a Status Report on Current and Follow-up Internal Audit Assignments by Larry Mandel, Vice Chancellor and Chief Audit Officer. "For the 2018 year, assignments were made to develop and execute individual campus audit plans; conduct audits of Information Technology (IT), Sponsored Programs and Construction; implement continuous auditing techniques; and to provide advisory services and investigation reviews. Follow-up on current and past assignments was also being conducted on approximately 35 completed campus reviews."
7. The **Committee on Institutional Advancement** presented the 2018-2019 CSU Trustees' Award for Outstanding Achievement. Each year, the Board provides "scholarships to high-achieving students who have demonstrated financial need and overcome profound personal hardships to attain an education from the CSU. These distinguished awards for superior academic achievement and extra-ordinary service to the community are funded by contributions from the CSU trustees, employees and friends of the university. Scholarships range from \$6,000 to \$12,000." The recipients – one from each CSU campus – were present (courtesy of Southwest Airlines) and being honored with a reception (sponsored by TELACU and Cisco) after the Board meeting on Tuesday.
8. On Wed., Sept. 12 at 8:30, the **Plenary Session** began with a long list of Public Speakers. William Blischke, President of ERFSA, gave his informal report [*as a courtesy to retired faculty and staff, the ERFSA representative usually gets the first speaking slot during the plenary session*]. Members of the employees union (CSUEU) demanded a copy of the signed labor contract and accused the CO of misinterpreting the contract in regards to grievances. Another member criticized the hiring of temporary workers, which "is becoming the norm, rather than the exception," thereby creating a new underclass.

The mother of a Humboldt State student, who was killed at an off-campus party on April 15, 2017, called for the resignation of president Rossbacher, asserting that "the

Board of Trustees and Dr. Lisa Rossbacher have to be held accountable for not protecting my baby boy.” She accused the campus of not having prepared her son for the transition from urban southern California to rural Arcata and demanded that the campus ceases to recruit African-American students. A member of Students for Quality Education (SQE) decried the “militarization of the CSU system.” Being a student at Cal State LA, she feels that the “police presence on campus” is too intense. When the speaker’s time was up and she was urged to finish her presentation, she threatened that the students would “shut this whole building down.”

The Board received the following *Reports*:

- a. The *Chair of the Board of Trustees*, Adam Day, introduced Juan García, the newly appointed student trustee. He also praised the **many high rankings of CSU campuses, especially in creating upward social mobility**. Chair Day further encouraged students to take full advantage of the services the CSU provides to assist them in achieving academic success.
- b. *Chancellor* Timothy White reported that **this year the CSU graduated the most students and admitted the largest entry class in its history**. He also spoke about his campus visit on student move-in day (which involved the lifting of boxes), and he reiterated that the CSU will care for its students “from move-in day to commencement.”
- c. The Chair of the *Academic Senate CSU* (ASCSU), Catherine Nelson, presented resolutions passed at the senate’s September meeting. She further announced the formation of a Faculty Trustee Nominating Committee and that the senate plans to schedule an unconscious bias workshop. Chair Nelson reflected on the Leadership Retreat in August and its focus on student success. **She insisted that “faculty expertise shall guide the decisions of the Chancellor’s Office” in curricular matters.**
- d. The President of the *California State Student Association* (CSSA), Mia Kagianas, outlined the students’ priorities for the new academic year. She called for a more sustainable, long-term funding from the legislators, stressed **the importance of a holistic and experiential education**, and reiterated the urgency to assist students whose basic needs are not met.
- e. The former President of the *CSU Alumni Council*, Dia Poole (in lieu of Manolo Morales), talked about the CSUnity Conference in August, where President Morales **hosted a panel on how students can become involved Alumni leaders**. She also expressed the Alumni Council’s willingness to assist with the priorities of the CSU.

To close the session, the Board approved all resolutions that were previously passed in the various committees [*there was only one resolution: the approval of the SJSU Interdisciplinary Science Building*].

9. The Board retreated into **Closed Session** to further discuss *Executive Personnel Matters*.

The meeting was adjourned on Wednesday, Sept. 12, at approximately noon.