PPA 510 Public Administrative/Management Processes

QUESTION 1

One public administration scholar has observed that most government agencies have the tendency to be reactive rather than proactive in their approach to public problem solving. In responding to this observation, please:

a. Differentiate between "proactive" and "reactive" problem solving;
b. Articulate whether you agree or disagree with the scholar’s observation, and the reasons for such agreement or disagreement;
c. Identify and discuss at least one instance in your own organization when it responded proactively; and

d. Identify and discuss at least one instance in your own organization when it responded reactively.

General Grading Criteria, Question 1

To successfully respond to the question:

1. You must answer the question
2. You must respond to all parts of the question
3. Your response must be well-reasoned, logical and well-organized
4. Your response must be well-written, which includes proper grammar, syntax, punctuation, and spelling.

Part A
"Proactive" problem solving tends to be required in periods of crisis and change. Hence, proactive problem solving attempts to address emerging needs, and to develop solutions that can head off a crisis. In the main, then, a proactive approach to problem solving will a) identify the emerging/potential crisis, need or situation; b) change procedures and methods presently in use that may be less appropriate for the new need or situation; and c) develop strategies that both will improve implementation of existing policies and will take into account the new reality presented by the change.

"Reactive" problem solving, on the other hand, tends to occur after the crisis or new situation has already emerged. At the same time, since public administrators tend, or are required, to approach problem solving using SOP's (e.g., technical and procedural) and personal experience with their daily jobs or tasks, reactive problem solving under these conditions can be itself a problem. That is, if we are reactive, and if we tend to use the same old approaches in response to a problem, what guarantees do we have that the same old approaches will work? This is not to suggest that reactive problem solving does not have its uses. In periods of stability and predictability, for example, reactive problem solving works just fine.

Part B
A successful response to this part of the question will depend in large part upon whether you correctly distinguished between "proactive" and "reactive" problem solving. A successful response also will depend upon your ability to present a convincing argument in detailing your agreement or disagreement.

Parts C, D
A successful response to these parts of the question will again depend in large part upon whether you correctly distinguished between "proactive" and "reactive" problem solving, and whether, therefore, the examples you present are consistent with a correct differentiation of the two.

QUESTION 2

Identify and discuss three ways in which a public budget can act as a force for change.

General Grading Criteria, Question 2

To successfully respond to the question:

1. You must answer the question
2. You must respond to all parts of the question
3. Your response must be well-reasoned, logical and well-organized
4. Your response must be well-written, which includes proper grammar, syntax, punctuation, and spelling.

There are any number of ways in which you could have addressed this question. How successfully, will depend upon your ability to make a cohesive, logical, convincing argument. Some ways might include, but certainly are not limited to, the following:

If we see a public budget, and the political and managerial processes producing it, as the primary formal mechanism "through which necessary resources are obtained, distributed, spent, and monitored", we also can say that the decisions made about distribution and expenditures of public monies signals government priorities. We also can say that, hence, public budgets can, indeed, be forces for change.

1. Government priorities. Examples of budgets as forces for changes in government priorities are legion; however, just one will suffice: the vast expenditures President Bush has proposed for a Department of Homeland Security will necessarily cause both Bush and Congress to divert funds from other needs to that of national security.

2. Executive control of government agencies. Executives at any level of government can cause sometimes monumental change in government agencies by simply increasing or decreasing agency budgets. For example, Ronald Reagan was a master at this particular strategy.

3. Legislative control of the Executive. In much the way that Executives can control and thereby change government agencies by increasing or decreasing budget requests, so too can a legislative body do the same favor for Executives. Consider, for example, how in 1995 President Clinton was forced to make spending cuts as part of a deficit-reduction package, thus changing dramatically his domestic program plans.

4. Distribution of power. Budgets, if nothing else, are the result of a sometimes fractious political process (e.g., witness what it took to pass the California State budget -- three months late -- in 2002). The "winners" of the budget power game can be seen as having exercised their ability to persuade, or to dissuade, more effectively than the "losers" of the game. Change can certainly occur for combatants on both sides of the playing field.

5. Unintended consequences. Sometimes, budgets produce unintended consequences and which, in turn, can be a force for change. For example, in the 1960's the State of Florida needed a tax-base boost. To effect that, State officials made a conscious choice to increase tourism, and to attract more residents, targeting older people from the Northeast who, the State figured, would want to spend Winters in a warmer climate and who also might want to retire to Florida. Good idea: until all the people they targeted began to age, to experience the problems of aging, and therefore to demand quite significant expenditures of public monies to address all those aging problems. So then, if budget priorities in the 1960's helped make real a desire to increase the tax base, by the mid-1980's, the unintended consequences have forced a dramatic change in Florida's fiscal and social health.
PPA 555 Budgeting & Finance

QUESTION I

Many possible solutions have emerged to address California’s structural budget deficit. The proposals tend to focus on either enhancing revenue streams or decreasing expenditure levels. One of the proposals involves increasing tax rates on cigarettes and alcoholic beverages.

   a. Discuss the advantages and disadvantages of sumptuary (sin) taxes relative to the evaluative criteria of taxation.

   b. Compare the advantages and disadvantages of sumptuary (sin) taxes to at least two other forms of taxation.

General Grading Criteria, Question I

   a. An acceptable answer should correctly identify equity, adequacy, collectability, and economic efficiency as the criteria for taxation. A "sin" tax may be regressive. As such, it has the potential to violate vertical equity. In addition, a sin tax targets specific consumption choices thus violating horizontal equity as well.

   Sin taxes are often "sold" to the public as a vehicle for revenue enhancement. While demand for cigarettes and alcohol is usually rather price inelastic, any decrease in demand may reduce the potential revenue windfall that sin tax supporters promote.

   With the proper incentives, sin tax revenue is collectable. It is a taxpayer passive tax for consumers but collection is dependent on the compliance of retailers.

   As demand inelastic goods, cigarette and alcohol consumption will be less affected by an increase in price than many other commodities. However, there are positive and negative externalities that may occur with the imposition of a sin tax. First, there are the potential losses to the supplier market that may result from a decrease in alcohol/cigarette consumption. Second there are potential work/leisure distortions that may also occur. Conversely, positive externalities such as a reduction in alcohol related deaths and cigarette related illnesses might also occur.

   b. An acceptable answer must provide a comprehensive comparison of sin taxes to two other forms of taxation. This comparison must include a comparison of the advantages and disadvantages of the taxes chosen for discussion.

   Property taxation -

   Sin taxes are more acceptable to voters than the property tax.
   Sin taxes are benefit based rather than wealth based.
   Sin taxes may discriminate against consumers with certain preferences while a property tax that is equitably administered will not.
   Sin taxes are not as stable a source of revenue as property taxes,

   Income taxation -

   Sin taxes are usually seen as more acceptable to voters.
   Sin taxes are benefit based rather than wealth based.
   Sin taxes do not provide the same equity as a graduated income tax.

QUESTION 2

In response to the California fiscal crisis, a gubernatorial candidate has stated that to control spending he would “open up the books and audit everything.”

   a. What are the two types of audits that can be performed?
b. What type information would these audits provide?
c. Can they be used to control spending and why or why not?

General Grading Criteria, Question

a. What are the two types of audits that can be performed?

The two types of audits that are performed are 1) financial and 2) performance.

b. What type information would these audits provide?

A financial audit provides information in two areas. First, financial audits test for compliance with applicable finance related laws and regulations. In other words, it tests to determine if the public organization complied with laws and regulations in terms of the use, recording, and reporting of revenues including grant proceeds and expenditures. The other area of a financial audit test whether the financial statements of the organization are a fair and accurate representation of the financial position of the organization and whether there are any material weaknesses in internal control.

A performance audit provides information on the efficiency, effectiveness, and economy of the organization. Performance audits that focus on efficiency are concerned with maximizing the amount of output for each unit of input. Effectiveness is concerned with the extent in which the organization is accomplishing its goals and objections. Performance audits that focus on economy are concerned with whether there is a net economic benefit from projects or programs. In other words, economy audit test to determine if economic benefits meet or exceed costs.

c. Can they be used to control spending and why or why not?

Both types of audits can provide information that can be used to address spending problems.

Obviously, the financial audit is necessary to make sure the State is in compliance with application laws and regulation and that the financial statements are accurate. One must make sure that you have accurate and reliable financial data prior to examining the cause of the spending problem.

Information from performance audits can help to improve the efficiency, effectiveness, and economy of the State's operations. However, these audits take a considerable amount of time to conduct and probably can not be of much use in the short-term to control spending.
PPA 577 Public Sector Human Resources Management

QUESTION I

With the advent of modern management strategies, it is increasingly common for those in the public sector to find themselves working in groups. This development poses some significant problems with respect to performance evaluation.

a. Should the performance of groups be taken into account in evaluating the performance of individuals?
   b. If so, how should the two be related?
   c. What are the implications of your answer for decisions regarding contingent pay, disciplinary actions, and employee development?

General Grading Criteria Question I

1. You must answer the question presented, not the one you wish had been presented
2. You must respond to all parts of the question
3. Your answer must demonstrate excellent writing skills
4. Your answer must be well organized and logical

In addition to meeting these general criteria, a successful answer will discuss the following:

A. Should group evaluations be used when evaluating individuals?

1. The use of quality circles, task forces, group planning approaches (nominal group technique, Delphi), and the Total quality management movement have all focused increased attention on the performance of work groups within organizations.
2. Effectiveness in this new environment consists of more than individual performance of personal tasks. Supportive and contributory behaviors are increasingly valued.

3. In such an environment, an exclusive focus on individual performance can actually be self-defeating for the organization, hindering the development of teamwork.
4. Also, peers in working groups are often better sources of information regarding the performance of team members than are team leaders or more distant superiors.
5. Furthermore, informal appears by fellow team members or team leaders can be more timely and may enhance performance more than formal procedures focused exclusively on individual activity.

B. How should group and individual evaluations be related?

1. Team rating procedures are probably inevitable where work teams are used extensively.
2. There are, however, problems associated with team ratings of individuals. Team members often go easy on each other. Anonymous ratings are one possible solution. Outside interpreters of team/peer ratings are another.
3. Team members should know in advance how evaluations of group performance and evaluations of individual performance by the group will figure into their overall performance appraisal. Ideally, that relationship should be the result of consultation and group decision.

C. What are the implications?

1. Contingent pay - contingent pay based on team performance raises a number of questions.
   a. same size reward for each member or different amounts (based on contribution, current pay, experience, skill level, etc).
   b. frequency of payout - greater frequency provides more immediate incentives.
   c. Contingent pay decisions made by group, leader, or outsider?
2. Two basic approaches.

d. Work-team results - rewards all members equally on the basis of group output cost savings, or quality improvement.
e. Gainsharing - sharing with employees (on the basis of some formula) of the greater-than-expected gains in productivity. Often difficult to do in the public sector as improved performance seldom leads to increased resources.

3. Disciplinary actions

Employee discipline problems can be complicated by group factors. Counseling and other approaches designed to modify behavior will often involve more than one person. Written documentation must carefully distinguish between issues that are within the employees control and those that are not (often difficult). Progressive discipline steps may have adverse effects on other team members who are dependent on the cooperation of the employee being disciplined. The culture of a team-oriented organization may not support discipline of any sort. In that environment, responsibility for problems in the workplace may be too widely shared to allow for discipline of individuals. Interpersonal consequences of disciplinary action may be too severe to justify the effort.

4. Employee development

Employee development will be complicated by group performance appraisal. Where the employee’s performance is view as an individual matter, personal goals can be set and skills development can be pursued in a relatively straightforward manner. Evaluations based on group performance would not always offer obvious strategies for individual employee development. OD interventions and other collective responses will be more often indicated. Incentives for employee development may also be weakened by the emphasis on group performance.

QUESTION 2

Many in the public sector believe it is inevitable that public agencies and public employee unions will always have adversarial relationships. Others see the future in more optimistic terms, holding out hope for more positive relationships between government agencies and their employees.

a. Where does such conflict come from and what are its effects?
b. Are there any forces at work that might give rise to more cooperative relationships between employee organizations and government agencies?
c. Are you optimistic or pessimistic about future cooperation in the public labor-management relationships?

General Grading Criteria Question 2

1. You must answer the question presented, not the one you wish had been presented
2. You must respond to all parts of the question
3. Your answer must demonstrate excellent writing skills
4. Your answer must be well organized and logical

In addition to meeting these general criteria, a successful answer will discuss the following:

A. Sources of conflict between employee organizations and management

1. Historical conflict and its effects

   a. The sovereignty doctrine - is collective bargaining and labor organizing in government philosophically defensible?
   b. Union busting (then and now) - how management has attempted to undermine union in the public sector
2. Current sources
   a. Adversarial culture - where does it come from and what is its effect?
   b. Adversarial structures - how bargaining, grievance, and arbitration procedures reduce the likelihood of labor/management cooperation.
   c. Cutback/budget pressure - the resulting stresses and their role in increasing labor/management conflict
   d. Contracting out - its role in union-busting and the resulting tension.
   e. Performance appraisal - labor/management tension resulting from the need to evaluate workers.

B. Sources of cooperation
   1. TQM - Focusing on overall organizational performance and the role of civil servants generally in improving it.
   2. Participative Decision Making (PDM) - Increasing labor/management communication and improving worker morale
   3. "Reinventing" government - Emphasis on "front-line" civil servants as sources of organizational improvement
   4. Quality circles - Breaking down the barriers between labor and management on a limited number of concrete issues establishes a more cooperative pattern.
   5. Shared commitment to public objectives.

C. The current trend
   1. Only marginal growth in union membership, encourages confrontational management strategies.
   2. Spread of alternative dispute resolution offers the chance of less confrontational labor/management relations.
   3. Continued revenue pressures raise tensions generally

D. Potential for future cooperation
   1. Reasons for pessimism
   a. Lack of full union membership among employees complicates the union's role as employee representative.
   b. Midlevel managers and supervisors left out of the process, removing a vital source of moderation.
   c. Cooperative committees too often undermine union role, setting employee against employee and management against union rep.

E. Union participation in decision-making is necessarily limited in adverse job action decisions.

2. Reasons for optimism
   a. New "customer service orientation" is refocusing attention of both, labor and management.
   b. Trend toward participatory management and flatter hierarchies is breaking down labor/management boundary.
   c. "Siege mentality" in government uniting workers and their supervisors to some extent.
   d. The "professionalization" of civil service is reducing stridency or employee organizations.
PPA 650 Contemporary Issues

QUESTION 1

Faced with a sudden decline in the economy in the Fall of 2001, many local governments are seeking to control costs by layoffs and a shortened work week. This raises questions for both public employees and the public they serve. Explain and illustrate your understanding of these developments as they are faced by both the internal audience (employees) and external audience (citizens/voters).

A. Describe and discuss at least two implications for public employment
B. Describe and discuss at least two implications for service provision.

Grading Criteria Question 1

At minimum:
1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question.
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments.

Minimally acceptable (pass) answer – must include:

Description of strategies adopted by government to cut costs and increase efficiency can include:
- downsizing
- rightsizing
- contracting out
- devolution of responsibilities to lower levels
- joint ventures
- and others

Impacts on public employment can include:
- unions
- morale
- recruitment and retention
- early retirement packages
- and others

Impacts on service provision can include:
- quality of service
- contract enforcement and monitoring
- citizen satisfaction
- equity for disadvantaged groups
- and others

QUESTION 2

California legislators are limited in the number of years they can serve. A recent measure on the ballot would have weakened the term limits placed on California legislators.

A. What are the positive effects of term limits for the public bureaucracy?
B. What are the negative effects of term limits for the public bureaucracy?
C. How can the negative effects for the bureaucracy be mitigated?

Grading Criteria Question 2

At minimum:
1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question.
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments.

Minimally acceptable (pass) answer – must include:

The positive effects of term limits for the bureaucracy revolve around the higher status that career public employees attain, since they provide the continuity between administrations and have specialized knowledge that elected official are likely to lack; the advantages of bureaucracy over politics; and others.
The negative effects of term limits for the bureaucracy include the possibility of frequent shifts in policy as new politicians are elected; a lack of carefully constructed working relationships between politicians and career public servants; and others.

Any reasonable suggestions about how to mitigate the negative effects on the bureaucracy will be accepted as long as they are logical and well written.

PPA 660 Organization Theory and Behavior

QUESTION 1

Any number of writers in the organization theory/behavior literature could be said to have exerted great influence on the study of organizations. Among them: Max Weber, Frederick Taylor, Chester Barnard, Luther Gulick, James D. Thompson, Fred Fiedler, Herbert Simon, Chris Argyris.

a. Select any two writers, either from the list above, or two of your own choosing. List and discuss at least one idea or concept advanced by each of those two writers.

b. Defend your choices. That is, specifically explain why those writers, through their ideas or concepts, qualify as having "exerted great influence" on the study of organizations.

c. Cite two examples, drawn from a public or nonprofit organization with which you are familiar, that illustrates application of the two ideas or concepts you selected in "a", above.

Grading Criteria Question 1

At minimum, your response must exhibit:

a. Excellent writing skills. This includes syntax, grammar, spelling, punctuation.

b. Substantive quality

c. Excellent logic and organization

1. For parts "b" and "c" of the question, your response will depend upon both the writers and ideas/concepts you chose in part "a".

2. You must correctly link the writer with his or her influential idea or concept.

3. You must correctly explain the idea or concept. That is, for example, if you chose Maslow's theory of human motivation, and then proceeded to explain McGregor's Theories X and Y, that plainly would be incorrect.

4. Defense of your choices must be substantive and specific. If you say, for example, that Maslow's ideas, indeed, have
"exerted great influence" on the study of organizations, you must specifically discuss the ways in which this occurred.

**QUESTION 2**

"Authority" has been a well-covered aspect of organization theory and behavior. Its links to the aspects of structure, culture, motivation, leadership, conflict, power, and organization politics - among many others - are plain.

a. Provide at least two definitions of "authority." Note, the question calls for "definition", not "description".
b. Identify at least two aspects of organization theory/behavior from the list, above, and explain how authority influences, and/or is influenced by, those aspects.
c. Cite at least two examples drawn from an organization with which you are familiar, describing the kind(s) of authority structure(s) at work therein.

**Grading Criteria, Question 2**

At minimum, your response must exhibit:

a. Excellent writing skills. This includes syntax, grammar, spelling and punctuation.
b. Substantive quality
c. Excellent logic and organization

Part a: "Authority" may be defined as top-down (decision-making is highly centralized at the top, which comes from many of the early writers in organizations); as bottom-up (Barnard's idea that issuance of an order has no meaning unless it is accepted and followed by the person(s) to whom the order is issued); as the law of the situation (Mary Follett), as power (e.g., French and Raven). You may have chosen another, perfectly acceptable, definition.

Part b: The quality of your response will depend upon a well-written, substantively good discussion of the ways in which authority influences or is influenced by the two aspects of organizational life you chose.

Part c: An acceptable response to this part of the question vii-ii depend upon whether you can present good descriptions of the kind(s) of authority structure(s) at work in the organization under discussion.
PPA 670 Policy Issue Analysis

At minimum:
1. You must answer the question.
2. You must answer all parts of the question.
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments

Core Concepts
Assessing policy alternatives
Selection of appropriate analytical techniques
Appropriate application of analytical techniques to policy alternatives

Question 1

As a result of numerous citizen complaints, the City of Alta Valle decided to review their policy on "adult entertainment dance" establishments within the city. Extensive work by city policy analysts produced the following alternatives:

- Do nothing and keep the current city ordinances.
- Enact a new policy prohibiting physical contact between patrons and dancers with the establishment of a 6 foot "no touch" zone around the dance areas.
- Revise the city zoning policy to limit adult establishments to industrial areas at least 1,000 ft. from any residential area, playground, school, or church.

Answer each of the following questions:

a. Propose two policy analysis techniques which could be used to analyze all of the proposed alternatives. Fully discuss and justify your choices.

b. Discuss, in detail, how each of the chosen techniques would be applied to each of the proposed alternatives.

Grading Criteria Question 1

Minimally acceptable answer (pass)--must include 1-5 below
1. Addresses the question that was asked
2. Addresses all parts of the question (a, b)
3. Provides a clear, well-reasoned discussion of two policy alternative analytical techniques which are applicable to all three defined policy options. Each technique chosen must be equally applicable to each policy option. Well reasoned justification for choice is provided.
4. Provides a clear, well-reasoned discussion of the application of each chosen analytical technique to each defined policy alternative. This discussion must include specific analysis of how the analytical technique would be applied to the policy alternative and the information resulting from that application.
5. Answer is logical, well-written, persuasive

Unacceptable answer (fail)--any of the following is a fail:
1. Does not address the question that was asked
2. Does not address all parts of the question (a, b)
3. Does not identify two policy alternative analytical techniques which are applicable to all three defined policy options.
4. Does not address justification for analytical techniques chosen.
5. Does not fully discuss the application of each chosen analytical technique to each defined policy alternative.
6. Answer is not logical, or not well-written, or not persuasive

Core Concepts
Policy Evaluation
Choosing an appropriate evaluation strategy
Importance of measuring effectiveness in evaluation

QUESTION 2

Five years ago, your city adopted a zero-tolerance policy on graffiti and "tagging" and imposed very severe penalties for even first-time offenders. As part of the policy, city officials collect information on all graffiti and "tagging"
incidents reported, number of arrests, penalties imposed and demographic profiles of the convicted offenders.

Design an **evaluation strategy** to determine whether or not the policy has been successful in reducing graffiti and "tagging" in the city. Your strategy must include **at least two evaluation methods**. Fully **explain and justify** your strategy and choices.

**Grading Criteria Question 2**

Minimally acceptable answer (pass) -- must include 1-7 below

1. Addresses the question that was asked
2. Addresses all parts of the question
3. Provides a clear and well-reasoned discussion of an evaluation strategy that specifically addresses the problems identified.
4. Discusses two appropriate techniques and methods for the chosen evaluation strategy:
5. The evaluation strategy presented must address assessment of the effectiveness of the policy, not simply output measures. This will require use of a contemporary/innovative evaluation strategy.

   a. Traditional approaches are usually easier to conduct, quick, simple to understand and provide a "bottom line" result. They are also methodologically invalid, poor indicators of effectiveness, easy to manipulate and prone to emphasizing negative aspects of the program.

   b. Contemporary/Innovative approaches are scientifically rigorous, both internally and externally valid, more comprehensive and produce true assessments of program effectiveness. They are also complex to design, expensive, time-consuming and require substantial expertise to conduct.

6. Discusses strategy choice and justifies evaluation methods choice in the context of the problem situation presented.
7. Answer is logical, well-written, persuasive

Unacceptable answer (fail)--any of the following is a fail:

1. Does not address the question that was asked
2. Does not address all parts of the question
3. Does not identify an appropriate evaluation strategy
4. Does not discuss two appropriate techniques or associates techniques and methods discussed with the incorrect strategy.
5. Fails to choose an appropriate contemporary/innovative evaluation strategy or fails to adequately and appropriately justify the strategy selection.
6. Answer is not logical, or not well-written, or not persuasive
**PPA 696 Comprehensive Examination**

At minimum:
1. You must answer the question.
2. You must answer all parts of the question.
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments

**QUESTION 1**

A Health Maintenance Organization conducts a study on which of two programs ("STOP" or "QUIT") is better for helping smokers to quit. The HMO concludes that the "STOP" program was more effective. Here are some facts about the HMO's research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“STOP” Program</th>
<th>“QUIT” Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participants are volunteers</td>
<td>Participants are volunteers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sessions offered Monday through Friday</td>
<td>Sessions offered on Saturdays and Sundays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collected at the end of nine months</td>
<td>Data collected at the end of six months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No control group</td>
<td>No control group</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Also, during the course of the study, the state greatly increased the taxes on a pack of cigarettes.

a. Discuss the threats to the validity of the HMO’s research project.
b. Do you have confidence in the HMO’s findings?

**Grading Criteria Question 1**

a. An acceptable answer must, at a minimum, include the following observations. First, participants in both the STOP and QUIT program self-select. Subjects who work during the week would probably self-select the QUIT rather than the STOP program. Therefore, there is no random selection of subjects and that may produce a sample that is not representative of the target population. This will reduce the external validity of the research project.

Second, there is no random assignment of subjects to groups. Subjects are allowed to select which group they want to participate in leading to a lack of equivalency between the groups. Since the groups are not equivalent, the researcher cannot assume that threats to validity such as history, maturation, mortality or selection bias are controlled.

Third, the primary history threat that is not controlled for in this study is the increase in cigarette taxes. Indeed, this cigarette tax increase may be the primary explanatory variable in smoking cessation rather than the individual programs.

Fourth, the data collection time frame is not equivalent. Since the data are collected immediately for the STOP program it is possible that some of these participants resumed smoking after the data collection period.

b. An acceptable answer must indicate a lack of confidence in the HMO’s findings and provide a comprehensive justification for this lack of confidence. Given the numerous threats to internal and external validity, the findings of the research program are suspect. In terms of internal validity, the existence of a cigarette tax rate increase diminishes any confidence the researchers may have in asserting that the programs led to smoking cessation. The non-equivalency of the groups and the non-representative nature of the sample also make it difficult to have any confidence in the HMO’s findings.

**QUESTION 2**

Two different polls were conducted in September by different firms about whether or not the recall of Governor Davis would be successful. The results were quite different. One found that the Governor would definitely
be recalled, by a margin of 60% for recall to 40% against (with a margin of error of +/- 3%). The other found that the Governor would definitely not be recalled, by a margin of 40% for to 60% against (again with a margin of error of +/-3%).

The first poll was a random sample of people who voted in the last presidential election, and only those people who said they were likely to vote in the recall election were reflected in the poll. The second poll used a simple random sample of all California adults over the age of 18, based on published telephone books.

a. Explain why, if both polls used probability-based (scientific random) sampling, the results could be so different.
b. What type of sampling technique would you have recommended to Governor Davis, if he wanted to know the most realistic estimate whether the recall would succeed?

Grading Criteria Question  2

a. An acceptable answer must recognize and explain the differences between the sampling frames used in the two polls. The sample in the first poll was selected from likely voters who voted in the last presidential election. This sampling frame consisted of voters who voted in the last presidential election and only those who indicated they would vote in the recall election were chosen. In the second poll, the sampling frame consisted of all California adults over the age of 18 irrespective of their voter participation in the last presidential election or their self-indicated likeliness to vote in the recall election. It is certainly possible that members of the first sample are much more likely to support the recall of Governor Davis than a broad sample of Californians. In short, the first sample represents the target population of most interest to Governor Davis, namely, likely voters.

b. An acceptable answer must identify the first sampling technique as the appropriate one for Governor Davis to use and provide a comprehensive justification for its use. The first sampling technique selects a random sample of likely voters from a sampling frame of individuals who voted in the last presidential election. This approach provides a sample that is representative of the true target population (likely voters) of interest for this study. A representative sample will increase the accuracy of the estimates produced by the poll.