Comprehensive Exam Fall 2001
Grading Criteria for
PPA 510 - Public Administrative/Management Processes

Question 1

1. The uniquely American practice of cooperation among and between the various levels of government has its roots in Federalism, one of the great principles underlying our Constitution.

A. Define or explain the American practice of cooperation among and between the various levels of government.
B. In what specific three ways does this practice assist public administration in the conduct of the public's business? Explain each fully.
C. In what specific three ways does this practice impede public administration in the conduct of the public's business? Explain each fully.

Question 1. Grading Criteria

At minimum:
1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question.
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments.

Minimally acceptable (pass) answer - must include:

A. Define or explain the American practice of cooperation among and between the various levels of government.

This may be defined as federalism, inter-governmental relations (IGR) or inter-governmental management. A brief history of the various phases of Federalism, IGR, or IGM may be sketched.

B. In what specific three ways does this practice assist public administration in the conduct of the public’s business? Explain each fully.

The benefits of may include the following and/or others:
- establish national minimum standards
- equalize resources
- improve government performance
- undertake programs which require huge resources
- stimulate experimentation
- achieve general social objectives

A. In what specific three ways does this practice impede public administration in the conduct of the public’s business? Explain each fully.

The drawbacks may include the following and/or others:
- administrative complexity
- preemptions
- mandates
- cross-cutting requirements
- overlapping jurisdictions with little coordination
- proliferation of interest groups to capture grant programs
- decisions made far away from those impacted
- complexity
- requires bargaining skills

Unacceptable (fail) answer - any criteria noted below:

1. Does not address the question that was asked
2. Does not answer all parts of the question
3. Answer does not exhibit good writing skills
4. Answer does not present logical and well-reasoned arguments.

Question 2

2. Some authors believe that managers are managers, no matter where they work. Other authors would argue that there are important difference in public, private, and non-profit sector management. A deputy city manager, a deputy director of United Way, and a deputy CEO of a company that makes computers get together to discuss this
discuss the differences, if any, in management in the three sectors.

b. discuss the similarities, if any, in management in the three sectors.

c. do you agree that managers are managers, no matter where they work? why or why not?

question 2. grading criteria

at minimum:

1. you must answer the question
2. you must answer all parts of the question.
3. you must exhibit good writing skills
4. you must present logical and well-reasoned arguments.

minimally acceptable (pass) answer - must include:

a. discuss the differences, if any, in management in the three sectors.

the answer should include a definition of the public sector, the non-profit sector, and the private sector, or differentiate among the three sectors in some way. the goals and objectives of each sector should be identified, and linked to management practices.

b. discuss the similarities, if any, in management in the three sectors.

the answer should include a discussion of the similarities of the management function across the three sectors, and should link the similarities to management practices.

c. do you agree that managers are managers, no matter where they work? why or why not?

the answer should be reasonable, logical, and well-argued.

unacceptable (fail) answer - any criteria noted below:

1. does not address the question that was asked
2. does not answer all parts of the question
3. answer does not exhibit good writing skills
4. answer does not present logical and well-reasoned arguments.
notes that excess burden can be reduced by (1) keeping tax rates low, (2) by avoiding different tax rates on similar products, similar uses for competing productive resources, or similar ways of earning income, and (3) avoiding taxes in markets where buyers or sellers react substantially to changes in price.

A. Using the perspective of economic efficiency, should the State increase individual income tax rates? Justify your answer.

In the case of the state individual income tax, any rate increase theoretically causes efficiency losses as workers face a higher relative price for working. To cover the projected budget deficit would require an increase of approximately 30% in the tax rate. A 30% individual tax rate increase could have significant efficiency losses. Further, with the possible exception of Oregon, California would have even higher individual tax rates compared to its border-states. Although interstate tax differentials have moderate effects on employment, relatively high differentials that persist over time would have a negative effect on employment in the state.

B. Using the perspective of economic efficiency, should the State increase the general sales tax rate? Justify your answer.

With respect to the general sales tax, an increase in the tax rate would impose a price increase on taxable consumer goods. In order to close the projected budget deficit, the increase in the rate would have to be approximately 50%. Again such a large increase in any given year would likely have considerable efficiency losses. Further, such an increase would present a fairly large difference in tax rates compared with the border-states. Such a difference could lead to consumers shopping just across the border to take advantage of tax rate differentials.

C. Would you recommend any tax increase to help solve the State’s fiscal problems? Explain what kind, and why or why not.

Addressing the question of whether any tax increase is feasible from an economic efficiency perspective, that answer is, no one source is likely to be able to close the deficit without substantial efficiency losses. Reviewing the table of total state tax revenues, it is clear that California is a high tax state even taking into account its high per capita income status. It may be possible to raise rates or expand the base of a number of tax sources but none very far given the present tax burden.

Passing Answer

- Demonstrate a basic understanding of efficiency losses due to taxation.
- Recognize the individual income tax rate would have to be increased substantially which would cause considerable efficiency losses.
  
d. Recognize the general sale tax rate would have to be increased substantially which would cause considerable efficiency losses.
e. Recognize that California is a high tax state particularly with respect to its border-states and a large increase in the tax burden would not be economically advantageous.

Passing with Distinction

Address all items mentioned in the criteria for a passing answer.

- Complete calculations necessary to estimate magnitude of changes required eliminating the deficit.
  
- Discuss the distinction between the accounting yield and the economic yield and how the high tax rates may actually reduce yield.

Question 2

2. A county is considering changing its budget format. Historically, the county has used a simple line-item approach. However, given a severe budget crisis that appears to be rather long term in nature, the county has decided to change to a different format. The county’s organizational structure resembles a commission approach in which the Board of Supervisors is the legislative body and through committees headed by a Supervisor, they oversee individual departments. These county Supervisors are especially interested in implementing expenditure reductions in a thoughtful manner while avoiding any negative effects on efficiency and effectiveness. Despite the impending budget crisis, the state is providing a grant to fund the implementation of a new budget
format.

A. Given this information, which type of budget format would you suggest, and why?

B. In answering the question, be sure to compare the budget format you are advocating to at least two other budget formats.

Grading Criteria Question 2

Criteria for a Minimally Acceptable Answer (Pass)

1. Identify the proper budget format for the situation.
2. Provide a comprehensive justification for the chosen format.
3. Compare this budget format to at least two other formats.
4. Accomplish the above requirements in a well-written and well-reasoned fashion.

A. Given this information, which type of budget format would you suggest, and why?

The proper budget format in this instance would appear to be performance budgeting. Since the county is interested in reducing expenditures in a "thoughtful" manner, the supervisors will require detailed information regarding the effectiveness and efficiency of the county’s current operations. A performance budget would provide the county with details regarding the inputs, process, and outputs associated with each department.

A program budget would allow the county to deconstruct programs and functions and would provide the county with the opportunity to examine the “big picture” of how programs related to objectives. However, to obtain the information necessary for making thoughtful cuts in expenditures, a program budget must include a measure of efficiency.

A Zero base budget approach could be beneficial by allowing supervisors to recognize the inherent consequences of reducing or eliminating certain programs. In short, while a performance budget is ideal, a properly designed program or ZBB approach could also work for the county’s situation. However, regardless of the format chosen, measures of efficiency and effectiveness are necessary to allow the county to make "thoughtful" reductions.

B. In answering the question, be sure to compare the budget format you are advocating to at least two other budget formats.

The chosen budget format could be compared to a variety of other formats including program, zero base, and target base budgeting. The answer must demonstrate a comprehensive understanding of at least two of these other formats. A comprehensive understanding is defined as demonstrated knowledge of how the format works and its advantages and disadvantages.

-Program Budgeting involves a recognition of how programs relate. In essence, what elements and functions assist in the accomplishment of program objectives?

Advantages:
Planning tool

Disadvantages:
Time Consuming
Difficult to separate functions/elements from objectives

-ZBB represents a movement toward rationality in budgeting. Decision units are identified and decision packages are constructed and prioritized. The decision packages reflect scenarios that related to the accomplishment of objectives and the consequences of not funding the scenario.

Advantages:
Rationality
Bottom-Up Approach

Disadvantages:
Time consuming
Produce too much information
Can never be truly rational and rarely use a true zero base.

- Target Base Budgeting represents a top-down approach to budget formulation. Targets are established at upper decision levels and politics greatly affect the establishment of targets.

Advantages:
  A recognition of the role of politics in budget decision-making

Disadvantages:
Top-down approach affords less opportunity for lower level managers to participate in setting goals and priorities than is seen in ZBB.

Unacceptable Answers (Fail) - Any One of the Following Problems
1. Failure to identify a suggested format.
2. Failure to justify the format within the context of the question.
3. Failure to compare the suggested format with at least two other formats.
4. Failure to produce a well-written, well-reasoned answer.

Grading Criteria Fall 2001
Comprehensive Examinations
PPA 577 Public Human Resources Management

Question 1

1. A recent article in the *Boston Globe* tells us that political appointments (latter-day spoils) in Massachusetts occur on a quite grand scale. In fact, so rampant is the practice that one jobholder responded "who isn't?" when asked if he were a political appointee. Develop an argument which discusses both:
   A. The benefits of political appointments to contemporary governance; and
   B. The disadvantages of political appointments to contemporary governance.

Grading Criteria, Question 1

1. You must answer the question.
2. You must respond to all parts of the question.
3. You must demonstrate excellent writing skills.
4. The response must be well-organized and logical.

In addition, a successful response to this question will refer to at least two of the benefits and disadvantages noted below, or others that are equally viable.

A. *The benefits of political appointments to contemporary governance*

The benefits of political appointments can be, but are not limited to:

1. Gives the elected official a "leg up" because it is assumed that the appointee will further that official's platform or policy agenda.

2. Can strengthen the relationship between those in the career service and those in the political realm, and may therefore reduce adversarialism.
3. Can lead to a productive collaboration which, in turn, can better serve (i.e., better than the appointee and career service each could do alone) the larger public interest.

4. May allow for more innovative solutions to public problems.

5. If approached correctly, may lead the way for more participative management.

B. The disadvantages of political appointments to contemporary governance.

The disadvantages of political appointments to contemporary governance can include, but are not limited to:

1. Shifts power and responsibility from career experts in the career bureaucracy to amateurs in the political sphere.

2. Compromises the value of "neutral competence" for which public administration is noted.

3. Inefficiency and ineffectiveness may be sacrificed.

4. Political and administrative roles become increasingly blurred.

5. Lines of communication and accountability become confusing, or are undermined.

6. Conflicting loyalties: the appointee to an individual; the career civil servant, to the organization.

7. Relatively rapid turnover of political appointees (who, on average, are in their jobs for about 21 months only) may place an unfair burden on career bureaucrats, who are left with whatever unresolved issues remain with each political appointees' departure.

8. The setting of long-term goals and thoughtful strategic planning become nearly impossible.

9. Has eroded the career civil service.

Question 2

2. The issue of whether public employees should be allowed to strike has long been a concern of public personnel administration. This issue was regarded as so important that, for many years, the possibility of cooperative labor-management relations in the public sector was hardly considered. In light of this history, write an essay which discusses:

A. The sources of conflict in the relationship between employee organizations and management in the public sector
B. The sources of cooperation in the relationship between employee organizations and management in the public sector
C. The current trend in the relationship
D. The potential for a more cooperative relationship in the future

Grading Criteria Question 2

1. You must answer the question presented, not the one you wish had been presented
2. You must respond to all parts of the question
3. Your answer must demonstrate excellent writing skills
4. Your answer must be well organized and logical

In addition to meeting these general criteria, a successful answer will discuss the following:

A. Sources of conflict between employee organizations and management

1. Historical conflict and its effects
   a. The sovereignty doctrine – is collective bargaining and labor organizing in government philosophically defensible?
   b. Union busting (then and now) – how management has attempted to undermine unions in the public sector
2. Current sources

   a. Adversarial culture – where does it come from and what is its effect?
   b. Adversarial structures – how bargaining, grievance, and arbitration procedures reduce the likelihood of labor/management cooperation.
   c. Cutback/budget pressure – the resulting stresses and their role in increasing labor/management conflict
   d. Contracting out – its role in union-busting and the resulting tension.
   e. Performance appraisal – labor/management tension resulting from the need to evaluate workers.

B. Sources of cooperation

   a. TQM – Focusing on overall organizational performance and the role of civil servants generally in improving it.
   b. Participative Decision Making (PDM) – Increasing labor/management communication and improving worker morale
   c. “Reinventing” government – Emphasis on “front-line” civil servants as sources of organizational improvement
   d. Quality circles– Breaking down the barriers between labor and management on a limited number of concrete issues establishes a more cooperative pattern.
   e. Shared commitment to public objectives.

C. The current trend

   a. Only marginal growth in union membership, encourages confrontational management strategies.
   b. Spread of alternative dispute resolution offers the chance of less confrontational labor/management relations.
   c. Continued revenue pressures raise tensions generally

D. Potential for future cooperation

1. Reasons for pessimism

   a. Lack of full union membership among employees complicates the union’s role as employee representative.
   b. Midlevel managers and supervisors left out of the process, removing a vital source of moderation.
   c. Cooperative committees too often undermine union role, setting employee against employee and management against union rep.
   d. Union participation in decision-making is necessarily limited in adverse job action decisions.

2. Reasons for optimism

   a. New “customer service orientation” is refocusing attention of both labor and management.
   b. Trend toward participatory management and flatter hierarchies is breaking down labor/management boundary.
   c. “Siege mentality” in government uniting workers and their supervisors to some extent.
   d. The “professionalization” of civil service is reducing stridency or employee organizations.
Comprehensive Exam Fall 2001
Grading Criteria
PPA 650 - Issues in Contemporary Public Administration

Question 1

1. Faced with a sudden decline in the economy in the Fall of 2001, many local governments are seeking to control costs by layoffs and a shortened work week. This raises questions for public employees, employee unions, and the public they serve. Explain and illustrate your understanding of these developments as they are faced by both the internal (employee) and external (citizens/voter) audiences.

A. Describe at least two implications for public employment.
B. Describe at least two implications for service provision.

Question 1. Grading Criteria

At a minimum:

1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments

The changes in the current US economy run somewhat contrary to the relatively unabated expansion in public sector employment over the past decade.

Changes in public attitudes toward government, and in particular toward government employee unions, paralleled the expansion of public sector unionization between 1960 and 1976. By allowing public employees to bargain collectively, legislatures recognized that the sovereignty of state government was not threatened by union activities. The 1976-1986 period witnessed a consolidation of public unions. Public attitudes toward public sector unions became less favorable during this period. The political power of public sector unions affects demand for government services, budgets, and outcomes of local elections. Since 1986, the growth in citizen demand for public services has declined. The slowdown in the growth of income and urbanization and the aging of the baby-boom population are two reasons for the decline in demand.

With today’s changes in economic conditions the growth rate of local government appears to have been stalled and in some cases reversed. This has affected growth in public sector programs and budgets. Combined with the aging of the workforce hired during the “build up phase” it seems that early retirement programs will increase and employers will simply freeze or leave unfilled openings due to retirement. Substitute programs and or replacement of services will likely come from the community-based and non-profit organization sectors or via modest sub contracts from governments to these types of organizations.

Unacceptable answer (fail):

1. Does not answer the question
2. Does not answer all parts of the question
3. Does not exhibit good writing skills
4. Is not logical or well-reasoned

Question 2

2. The California Energy Crisis is still with us. In the context of long range (or strategic) planning and the formal planning model:

A. What steps would you recommend the governor’s staff follow in order to develop a quality, long-range solution to the problem?
B. What are the various issues?
C. What entities should be considered (including political) in developing a solution?

Question 2. Grading Criteria

At a minimum:

1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. You must present logical and well-reasoned arguments
A. What steps would you recommend the governor’s staff follow in order to develop a quality, long-range solution to the problem?

Planning is a way of thinking about where an entity wants to go and how it will get there. Most forms of planning assume a formal or rational model, which outlines various steps in a process that are to be completed in sequence. Generally, the steps are:

- identify goals or the desired state to be attained
- identify the opportunities and threats in the environment, the strengths and weaknesses of the entity
- design and evaluate alternative courses of action
- set short, medium, and long-range goals
- implement a plan of action
- collect data, evaluate data, and establish feedback loops

Various techniques may be used in planning, such as forecasting, impact analysis, technology assessment, Delphi groups, and so forth.

B. What are the various issues?

There are a wide range of issues associated with attempting to do rational, long-term, or strategic planning, such as lack of data, lack of resources to carry it out, lack of techniques for forecasting, etc. Other issues could include those more closely associated with the energy crisis itself, such as California’s dependence on energy produced in other states, the inter-governmental system that involves federal regulators as well as private sector providers, the economic slowdown and California’s long-term energy contracts at higher than market prices, etc.

C. What entities should be considered (including political) in developing a solution?

The entities to be considered in developing a solution may consist of:

- legislative bodies
- executive bodies
- judicial bodies
- media
- public; voters; utility customers
- utility producers in the private, non-profit and public sectors
- professional staff
- activists, lobbyists, public interest groups
- other states (and/or countries, such as Canada or Mexico)

Unacceptable answer (fail):

1. Does not answer the question
2. Does not answer all parts of the question
3. Does not exhibit good writing skills
4. Is not logical or well-reasoned
Robert Merton identified several bureaucratic "dysfunctions" he said were typical in bureaucratic organizations.

A. Define bureaucratic "dysfunctions".
B. Identify and discuss at least two bureaucratic dysfunctions and their effects upon organizations and their members.
C. Identify and discuss at least two bureaucratic dysfunctions you may have seen in your own organization, or one with which you are familiar.

The specific bureaucratic dysfunctions Merton identifies are:

1. "Trained incapacity", which occurs when organization members function with blind spots. "Trained incapacity" leads people to operate only within the narrow sphere of authority defined by their jobs, thus creating the "not my station" mentality. Bureaucrats will therefore look for authorization or permission to do anything outside that narrow sphere.

2. The tendency toward "conformity" or "overconformity" which, Merton believes, is a function of the central role of rules, and how they serve to completely control human behavior. That is not a bad thing, of course; but, taken too far, blind attention to and application of rules certainly can create a culture of conformity, and this can result in "groupthink".

3. "Goal displacement" which, as noted above, occurs when bureaucrats abide by rules and regulations such that they become ends in themselves. In turn, they become not rational tools for organizational goals' accomplishment, but a method of self-protection for the bureaucrat.

4. That situation can lead, Merton says, to "sanctification", which occurs when people begin to "sanctify" rank and authority such that they begin to believe they have some kind of moral legitimacy.

5. "Red tape", which is self-explanatory.

The effects of each of those dysfunctions on both organizations and their members can be described and discussed using any number of scenarios or approaches. A successful response to this part of the question will depend upon your ability to, first, correctly identify at least two dysfunctions noted above; and, second, to properly apply them.

A. Identify and discuss at least two bureaucratic dysfunctions you may have seen in your own organization, or one with which you are familiar.
2. One enduring topic in the organization studies literature concerns the relationship between goal-setting in organizations and employee motivation or job satisfaction. Identify and discuss at least two theories of motivation that can help us understand that relationship.

Grading Criteria, Question 2

1. You must answer the question.
2. You must respond to all parts of the question.
3. You must demonstrate excellent writing skills.
4. The response must be well-organized and logical.

Most theories of motivation proceed from two assumptions. First, if the organization is to successfully motivate employees, it must attend to, and attempt to meet, employee needs (which are broadly defined, since "needs" will be variously defined, individual to individual); and second, properly motivated employees will have job satisfaction. Yet another assumption is that employees want to make substantive contributions to achievement of organization objectives. That includes having a voice in organizational goal-setting, and in identifying the tasks or activities required to achieve those goals. That said, among the various theories of motivation you could apply to this question are, but are not limited to:

1. Abraham Maslow: "Hierarchy of Needs"
2. Douglas McGregor: "Theory X" and "Theory Y"
3. Frederick Herzberg: "Two Factor Theory" (a/k/a hygiene/motivators; or satisfiers/dissatisfiers)
4. Clayton Alderfer: "ERG" theory
5. Victor Vroom: "Expectancy" theory
7. B.F. Skinner: "Reinforcement" or "Operant Conditioning" theory
8. Peter Drucker: MBO
10. Anthony Downs: "Personality types" in public organizations PPA 577,

Comprehensive Exam Fall 2001
Grading Criteria
PPA 670 Policy Issue Analysis

Question 1

1. Your city has been considering the construction of a new performing arts center to spur downtown development. The City Council has been slow to move on this issue. Suddenly, a local philanthropic organization offers to fund a sizable portion of the construction costs, if the city will accept its offer within 30 days.

   A. The City Council urgently needs you to do a quick policy analysis so that they can make a decision within 30 days. Describe your approach and the specific policy tools and techniques you would use.

   B. If you had time for a lengthier and more thorough analysis of this issue, what would you do differently? Describe your approach, and the specific policy tools and techniques you would use. Explain the differences or similarities to the quick analysis above.

Question 1. Grading Criteria

Minimally Acceptable Answer (Pass):

1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. Your answer must be logical and well-reasoned
A. The City Council urgently needs you to do a quick policy analysis so that they can make a decision within 30 days. Describe your approach and the specific policy tools and techniques you would use.

For a comparison of quick analysis versus researched analysis, see Patton and Sawicki, pp.3-4; p.18; and pp.158-163. Basically, a quick analysis involves the basic policy analysis model and is characterized by the following:

- Limited problem definition
- Limited search for alternatives
- Problem orientation, reactive
- Short time horizon
- Political approach, get things done
- More art than science
- Product is a short report or memorandum

Some of the specific tools or techniques that may be used include:

- Limited search for data
- Quick interviews
- Quick surveys
- Quick decision analysis
- Back-of-the-envelope calculations
- Political analysis
- First cut/issue analysis

B. If you had time for a lengthier and more thorough analysis of this issue, what would you do differently? Describe your approach, and the specific policy tools and techniques you would use. Explain the differences or similarities to the quick analysis above.

A lengthier and more thorough analysis would follow the same basic steps in the policy analysis model, but would differ in some ways:

- Extensive problem definition phase
- Exhaustive search for alternatives
- Solution orientation, can be more pro-active
- Longer time horizon
- Less pressure to come to a solution
- Can use more complex techniques
- Product is a plan or comprehensive document

Some of the specific tools or techniques that may be used include:

- Library and field research, literature reviews
- Identifying, gathering, and assessing usefulness of data
- Large-scale interviews, surveys
- Pilot projects
- Technical, economic, administrative feasibility analysis
- Implementation analysis, scenario writing
- Monitoring plan and design for evaluation

Question 2

2. An outbreak of a debilitating flu threatens to turn into a raging epidemic in County X. There is some flu vaccine, but not nearly enough for everyone in the county. Anyone not vaccinated is sure to get this flu. A group of county officials meets to discuss who should get the scarce vaccine. The officials include representatives from administration, public safety, public health, employee unions, public works, transportation, and so forth.

A. Outline a brief definition of the problem and the objectives to be met
B. What decision criteria would you use, and how would you define them?
C. What type of policy analysis techniques would you use in this case?

Question 2. Grading Criteria

Minimally Acceptable Answer (Pass):

1. You must answer the question
2. You must answer all parts of the question
3. You must exhibit good writing skills
4. Your answer must be logical and well-reasoned

A. Outline a brief definition of the problem and the objectives to be met
This is basically a problem of authoritative (i.e., government) allocation of a scarce resource among competing groups. The problem is that there is not enough vaccine to go around. The objectives should be consistent with those of responsible public sector officials, i.e., reference the public interest.

B. What decision criteria would you use, and how would you define them?

The major criteria for the decision on how to allocate the vaccine fall into the categories of equity and political acceptability. Equity can be defined in any number of accepted ways, for example, horizontal equity (the equal treatment of equals); vertical equity (the unequal treatment of unequals); transitional equity (people adversely affected by a decision may be compensated for their loss). Alternative allocation formulas would be judged on the extent to which they are equitable under one of these definitions. Political acceptability can be defined as whether any particular allocation formula will be acceptable to the relevant groups (the groups must be defined). Alternative allocation formulas would be judged on the extent to which they are supported by the relevant groups.

C. What type of policy analysis techniques would you use in this case?

The most appropriate policy analysis techniques would include the development of various alternative allocation formulas; the assessment of the alternatives in terms of equity and political criteria; and the selection of an appropriate decision rule for selecting one alternative for implementation. Techniques may include any appropriate to this problem and for quick decision analysis; but cost-benefit analysis, cost-effectiveness analysis, cost-revenue analysis, and net-benefit analysis are not appropriate.
The choice of a research design depends on such factors as the resources available for the study, time constraints, and whether the city has already begun to implement its two new strategies or not. If it has not, then an experimental or quasi-experimental design would be possible; if it already has, they would be more difficult. Other factors in the decision of which design to select include the amount of control the researcher has over factors other than the program which could affect the dependent variable (percentage of children with all required immunizations).

It is also worth noting that if the city has already begun implementation of the two strategies simultaneously, it will be very difficult if not impossible to discern the relative effectiveness of either strategy by itself on immunizations.

B. Identify and describe the threats to internal validity of the study you suggest

The common threats to internal validity include history; maturation; statistical regression; selection; experimental mortality; testing; instrumentation; and design contamination. Most of these threats are controlled for by experimental designs. Some of these threats are applicable to quasi-experimental designs. Only a few are applicable to cross-sectional designs, such as history and selection (if non-random sampling used). Threats to internal validity weaken the findings of the study, since something may have had an effect on the dependent variable other than the independent variable (strategies).

Unacceptable (Fail) Answer:
1. Did not answer the question
2. Did not answer all parts of the question
3. Answer was not well-written
4. Answer was not logical or well-reasoned
5. Answer did not correctly identify at least one way the research can be designed
6. Answer did not correctly identify and properly describe all the threats to internal validity appropriate to the research design selected (or a maximum of three, whichever is less).

Question 2

2. Your city is considering constructing an additional recreation center to meet the needs of its expanding population. The city council wants the center built to win votes, but the city manager thinks that there is only limited demand for an additional center.

A. Discuss the type of sampling methodology you would recommend if you were working for the city council, including populations, sampling frame, and exact sampling technique.

B. Discuss the type of sampling methodology you would recommend if you were working for the city manager, including populations, sampling frame, and exact sampling technique.

C. Compare the advantages and drawbacks of these two sampling methodologies.

Question 2. Grading Criteria

Criteria for an Acceptable (Pass) Answer

1. Correctly identify the advantages and disadvantages of probability sampling.
2. Correctly identify the advantages and disadvantages of non-probability sampling.
3. Identification of the correct population and sampling frame for the probability sampling example.
4. Identification of the correct population and sampling frame for the non-probability sampling example.
5. Identification of one exact type of probability sampling designs.
6. Identification of one exact type of non-probability sampling designs.
7. Well-written and reasoned answer.

A. Discuss the type of sampling methodology you would recommend if you were working for the city council, including populations, sampling frame, and exact sampling technique.
A non-probability type of sampling methodology would allow you to select a sample of residents who you believe would be likely to use the center. Therefore, the exact sampling method for this purpose would be a purposive sample. The sampling frame could come from a list of residents who currently utilize other recreation services offered by the city. In this manner, the true population would not be the city as a whole.

B. Discuss the type of sampling methodology you would recommend if you were working for the city manager, including populations, sampling frame, and exact sampling technique.

A probability-type of design would allow the city manager to assess the true level of demand for an additional recreation center. Possible probability designs could include simple random sampling without replacement or perhaps a stratified random sampling approach. In this manner, the true population would be the population of city residents while the sampling frame could consist of a list of residents of the community.

C. Compare the advantages and drawbacks of these two sampling methodologies.

The primary advantage of probability sampling lies in the random selection component. Random selection of the sample will produce a sample that closely approximates the population. Essentially, the sample statistics will closely approximate the population parameters. This allows for more confidence when applying inferential statistics. A non-probability design has the potential of generating a biased sample that does not closely approximate the population thus resulting in unreliable and invalid results. The disadvantage of probability sampling concerns the requisite resources for constructing a random sample. An inability to accurately define the target population or produce a proper sampling frame, when coupled with scarce resources, could make the use of probability sampling difficult.

However, there are serious ethical concerns associated with altering the sampling methodology to achieve a desired result. The ethical selection would be probability sampling in which random selection allows for estimation from the sample to a population. An accurate estimate of the true demand for the center would allow the city to most effectively and efficiently allocate its scarce resources.

Unacceptable Answers (Fail)

1. Inability to identify the advantages and disadvantages of probability sampling.
2. Inability to identify the advantages and disadvantages of non-probability sampling.
3. Inability to identify an exact probability sampling technique.
4. Inability to identify an exact non-probability sampling technique.
5. Inability to identify the proper population and sampling frame.