

# CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, LONG BEACH

#### COLLEGE OF EDUCATION

March 8, 2024

California Commission on Teacher Credentialing

Dear Commission Members,

The CSULB College of Education (CED) is pleased to submit its 7<sup>th</sup> Year Report as requested by the accreditation team in May of 2023. This report was completed by Dr. Daisy D. Alfaro, Assistant Director of Assessment & Accreditation, Dr. Rebecca Bustamante, Associate Dean of Credential Programs and Community Engagement, and Dr. Anna Ortiz, the Dean of the College of Education. This 7<sup>th</sup> Year Report will provide an overview of the progress made in addressing two requirements identified as inconsistent within Common Standard 4: Continuous Improvement. These include:

# Common Standard 4: Continuous Improvement (CTC Report of the Site Visit Team, 2023, p. 62)

Common Standards	Status
1) Institutional Infrastructure to Support Educator Preparation	Met
2) Candidate Recruitment and Support	Met
3) Course of Study, Fieldwork and Clinical Practice	Met
4) Continuous Improvement	Met with Concerns
5) Program Impact	Met

Common Standard 4: Continuous Improvement	Team Finding
The education unit develops and implements a comprehensive continuous improvement process at both the unit level and within each of its programs that identifies program and unit effectiveness and makes appropriate modifications based on findings.	Consistently
The education unit and its programs regularly assess their effectiveness in relation to the course of study offered, fieldwork and clinical practice, and support services for candidates.	Inconsistently
Both the unit and its programs regularly and systematically collect, analyze, and use candidate and program completer data as well as data reflecting the effectiveness of unit operations to improve programs and their services.	Consistently
The continuous improvement process includes multiple sources of data including 1) the extent to which candidates are prepared to enter professional practice; and 2) feedback from key constituencies such as employers and community partners about the quality of the preparation.	Inconsistently

In the following paragraphs, we will address the inconsistencies highlighted by the CTC Site Visit Team and provide an overview and evidence of the actions taken since the CTC Site Visit in February of 2023.

## Strategic Plan

The AAO will need support to meet their strategic plan objectives and a timeline to have completed and started strategic plan implementation in Fall 2023 (p. 63).

Strategic Plan. The CED Assessment & Accreditation Office (AAO) developed and implemented a new strategic plan that is informed by the emerging CED Strategic Plan and is guided by the vision of the new CED Dean Anna Ortiz and Associate Dean Rebecca Bustamante. The strategic planning process also integrated insights from feedback collected during the AY 2022-2023 AAO Listening Tour, recommendations from the 2023 CTC Accreditation Site Visit, and input from CED Leadership and the Faculty Assessment Committee. The result is a strategic plan that sets out to establish the AAO as a trusted and collaborative resource that engages in data democratization efforts (i.e., makes data more accessible); cultivates a culture of assessment that centers equity; and supports data-driven decision-making and continuous improvement across the college. Following a thorough review process, the CED AAO Strategic Plan (2023-2026) was implemented in the Fall of 2023 and will guide the AAO's initiatives over the next three years.

Restructuring of the AAO. The recent restructuring of the AAO Assistant Director role by the Deans positions the AAO to inform data-driven decision-making and meet our strategic plan objectives. The Assistant Director now participates in CED Leadership Meetings, attended by the deans and department chairs, as well as the CED Initial Teacher Preparation Program (ITPP) meetings, which include all faculty program coordinators and lead support staff of our preparation programs and teacher candidates. Participation in these meetings and the hiring of a Data Analyst allows the AAO to promptly address the emerging data needs of the college and its programs. For instance, in response to faculty observations of increased student withdrawals, the AAO conducted an analysis that identified the credential courses with higher withdrawal rates. This analysis enabled programs to identify program changes or additional support services required to promote the retention of our students in our credential courses and programs.

### **Comprehensive Continuous Improvement Process**

Although there was ample evidence that all credential programs were collecting, analyzing, and using data for program improvement, there was inconsistent evidence the unit has a developed and implemented comprehensive continuous improvement process at the unit level that identifies program and unit effectiveness and makes appropriate modifications based on findings (p. 63).

Continuous Improvement Cycle. The CED's Continuous Improvement Cycle is centered on the college's conceptual framework and strategic priorities, state and university guidelines, as well as program-specific professional standards for accreditation. Leading the implementation of this comprehensive continuous improvement cycle at the unit level is the

CED Assessment & Accreditation Office (AAO). The AAO ensures that all unit- and program-level assessment activities align with the <u>Unit Assessment System (UAS)</u> strategic priorities, providing data support to facilitate data-driven decision-making and drive continuous improvement across the college.

At the time of the CTC Site Visit, the unit had just experienced significant transitions, including an interim Dean and the restructuring of the AAO office. Since then, with the appointment of a new Dean and the addition of new AAO staff, considerable efforts have been made to ensure that credential programs, including both the CED and College of Health and Human Services (CHHS), have access to data. Central to this effort has been the AAO's commitment to data democratization, aiming to make data more accessible.

AAO Data Democratization Initiative. Data democratization efforts include various strategies, such as the AAO providing direct data support to the dean (e.g., inquiry on <u>credentials completed</u>). Additionally, the AAO Assistant Director participates in the CED Leadership Meetings and CED Extended Leadership Meetings to provide data support to the deans, chairs, directors, staff, and advisors (e.g., inquiry on EDSS 300). Furthermore, in alignment with the CED's commitment to equity, diversity, and inclusion (EDI), the AAO has dedicated considerable effort to cultivating a culture of assessment that centers on equity. All data collection, analysis, and reporting of data to the unit are disaggregated by demographic factors to identify and address disparities. To ensure the inclusion of diverse perspectives and lived experiences, the AAO will also be incorporating humanizing forms of data collection. Beginning in the Spring of 2024, the AAO will be facilitating CED focus groups. The AAO has also led a concerted effort to boost response rates across our surveys to obtain meaningful data that accurately represents our entire student population (i.e., undergraduate, degree, and credential students). For instance, the CED Exit Survey had an increase from a 32% response rate in 2022 to an impressive 64% in 2023, marking a substantial 107% increase within a single year. Lastly, all reports have been elevated by incorporating enhanced data visualization techniques that make them user-friendly; reports are presented in multiple platforms (e.g., infographics, executive summaries, and technical reports); and they are disseminated across various communication platforms (e.g., text messages, emails, CED news, and Instagram). Collectively, these efforts have empowered the unit to have access to and actively engage with the data to inform decision-making and drive continuous program improvement.

There was inconsistent evidence that the unit regularly and systematically collects, analyzes, and uses candidate and program completer data as well as data reflecting the effectiveness of unit operations to improve all programs and their services (p. 63).

**Development of MyCED.** There has been an ongoing effort by the CED to enhance the unit's capacity for regularly and systematically collecting data on credential candidates and completers. Recognizing the unique challenges that come with tracking our credential candidates, the CED has allocated resources to develop and implement MyCED, a centralized credential candidate tracking system. MyCED will support students throughout their entire journey in the CED, from the <u>submission of an application</u>, coursework, fieldwork and clinical practice to program milestones.

MyCED continues to be in development, with the MyCED team refining and adding to its functionalities. Currently, the MyCED Initial Teacher Credential Program Application feature is operational. Additionally, the Fieldwork/Clinical Practice feature is also operational and allows staff, faculty, district-employed supervisors, and students to upload, track, and approve prerequisite documents (i.e., CTC Certificate of Clearance and negative TB Test documentation) and hours conducted in affiliated schools and community partners. This system promises to enhance communication among college staff, faculty, program coordinators, district-employed supervisors, and students. In addition, it offers the unit the ability to access credential candidate data, monitor their progress in programs, and identify any challenges they may encounter in reaching program milestones.

Data-Sharing Partnerships & Streamlining Processes. Since the restructuring of the AAO, the office has taken the lead in accreditation, program review, annual program learning outcomes assessment, and supporting data-driven decision-making. To efficiently complete these activities, the AAO has prioritized building data-sharing partnerships to enhance access to credential student data and streamline processes. Since the Fall of 2023, discussions with CSULB Enrollment Services and CSULB Institutional Research & Analytics (IR&A) have focused on setting up data queries that accurately capture our credential students. These collaborations have resulted in increased accuracy, efficiency in reporting, and a smoother process for completing annual and periodic reports from the state, CSU system, and CSULB units (e.g., Title II, ADS, IPAC, external reviews, program accreditation, and cyclical college accreditation reports). The AAO's data democratization initiative has significantly improved the accessibility of this data within the unit, ensuring it is readily available and accurate.

Integration of Credential Programs into Surveys. Another impactful effort that has greatly increased the unit's ability to systematically collect, analyze, and report on candidate and completer data is the incorporation of credential programs into the CED Exit Survey and CED Pulse Survey. Before this integration, most credential programs administered their own surveys, and this data was not accessible to the unit. Collaborating with the Faculty Assessment Committee, CED and CHHS credential program coordinators, staff, and CED student leaders during the Fall of 2023, we revised survey questions to align with both college-wide and credential-specific goals. In addition, all credential programs now participate in the newly created CED Pulse Survey, a quick 3-minute, 7-question survey designed to capture the experiences of our current students. By conducting this survey each semester, we can share insights with CED leadership, faculty, and staff, allowing them to address our candidate's needs in real time. Both surveys will provide the unit with a more comprehensive understanding of all the students we serve.

Advancing CalTPA/APA Reporting. Associate Dean Bustamante and the AAO have collaborated closely with the Teacher Education Chair, credential program director, and coordinators to address the unique needs of credential programs and students related to CalTPA and CalAPA assessments. As part of our efforts to democratize data and promote continuous improvement, the AAO has assumed the role of logging in Pearson edReport results into a newly developed user-friendly CalTPA/APA Data Tracker Report. These reports will be provided to Associate Dean Bustamante, department chairs, credential director or coordinator, Teacher Preparation Advising Center (TPAC) Assistant Director, and the Student Assessment Support coordinator every three weeks. These reports will enable credential programs to efficiently monitor student pass rates, condition codes, pass

achievement, and submission timeliness. Most importantly, this report offers valuable and timely insights into students requiring remediation, ensuring they receive the necessary <a href="CalTPA support and remediation">CalTPA support and remediation</a> from our newly appointed Student Assessment Support Coordinator.

Meaningful Dialogue Around Data. Lastly, the AAO has prioritized reimagining the way we present data to the unit. We have created a structure for collectively reflecting on the data and coming up with actionable steps to improve all programs and services. For instance, previous CED Exit Survey Findings Reports were disseminated during the summer, which resulted in minimal engagement from faculty. Instead, this year, we redesigned the Beyond Accreditation Workshop into the Program Assessment for Student Success (PASS).

Workshop which brought all degree and credential program coordinators to carefully review the CED Exit Survey data, participate in guided discussions, and formulate actionable next steps. This shift has resulted in innovative efforts by our departments, such as the creation of a Basic Needs and Campus Resources pamphlet and the implementation of actionable steps derived from the CED Pulse Survey findings, both designed to address pressing student needs within our college.

Overall, these efforts have yielded meaningful and accurate data that has been utilized for data-driven decision-making, informing student support services, contributing to program planning, and most importantly, providing evidence on how well the college is fulfilling its mission of fostering student success.

There was inconsistent evidence for systematic data use by the Unit for some credential programs (Bilingual Authorization, Reading and Literacy Added Authorization, PPS School Counseling, PPS School Psychology, PPS School Social Work, and Speech-Language Pathology) (p.62)

In response to the 2023 CTC Site Visit, the College of Education partnered with the <u>CSULB</u> <u>Office of Program and Institutional Effectiveness (OPIE)</u> to introduce several initiatives aimed at enhancing educational effectiveness and providing guidance and feedback for continuous program improvement. Starting in the Fall of 2023, all our credential programs are required to undergo periodic expedited program reviews and annual assessments of program learning outcomes. These assessments are reviewed by the Institutional and Program Assessment Council (IPAC), which provides feedback to improve student learning.

Periodic Program Reviews. Recognizing the successful CTC accreditation review of our credential programs, it was determined that our credential programs would undergo an IPAC Expedited Program Review. For 2023-2024, three credential programs were under program review. These include PPS School Psychology, PPS School Counseling, and PASC Educational Administration (EDAD). Through this review, each program will assess data provided by the AAO, focusing on various metrics such as full-time student enrollment by department, student headcount by program, and graduation rates. Department Chairs and Program Coordinators will explain significant trends and discuss implications for the program. Additionally, these reports require programs to discuss future planning and actions aimed at program improvement.

Annual PLO Assessment. OPIE and the unit also now require and guide all our credential programs through the completion of the IPAC Annual Assessment based on the progress of one program learning outcome. Last Fall of 2023, the AAO supported all credential program coordinators as they developed Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) that were closely aligned to the California Teaching Performance Expectations (TPEs) and as they navigated this reporting process for the first time. The unit and numerous credential programs took this opportunity to reflect on their PLOs and make data-informed decisions on how to enhance student learning.

Graduate Studies Office Data Support. The CED Graduate Studies Office (GSO) has also played an important role in providing data support to our advanced credential programs, including PPS School Counseling, PPS School Psychology, and Teacher Librarian. Serving as an initial point of contact for advanced credential applicants, the GSO provides program coordinators with weekly application submission reports to support the application review process. They also oversee student enrollment, monitor progress toward degree completion, and collaborate closely with the CED Credential Center to advise candidates on credential requirements and deadlines. Leveraging their access to advanced credential student data, they provide the unit and credential program coordinators with comprehensive historical data, including application trends, admissions, yield rates over the last decade, and progress to degree and graduation reports.

Center was commended for their outstanding support of our credential candidates. In addition to this pivotal role, they also provide valuable data support and reports to the unit and all our credential programs. Annually, they provide the CED Dean with a report detailing all credentials granted and processed in the last year, along with trends over the last decade. They also generate reports on the numbers of Science/Math/Computer Science Credentials and Authorizations processed and recommended for the previous academic year, which are also shared with the unit head. In addition to providing the AAO with completion data and support to complete the CTC ADS and Title II Reports, they take the lead in completing other CTC, CSU, CSULB, and CED reporting requirements. Furthermore, they provide program coordinators with reports of credentials recommended in the last five years.

CHHS Data Support. In response to the CTC recommendations, we have prioritized and become intentional in the engagement of our CHHS credential programs. In collaboration with CED Associate Dean Bustamante, CHHS Associate Dean Tiffanye Vargas, CHHS program coordinators, and the AAO, we have developed a systematic approach to further involve their programs in our unit's continuous improvement process. One immediate step was adding a CHHS representative to the Faculty Assessment Committee. In addition, the AAO continues to work closely with CHHS credential program coordinators to better understand their programs and data needs, ensuring alignment to inform CTC ADS and Title II reporting.

In summary, these initiatives and efforts are significant steps in the unit's commitment to systematically collect data and support all our credential programs as they engage in processes aimed at improving student learning and outcomes.

### **Faculty Assessment Committee**

The AAO unit assessment committee is scheduled to meet monthly; however, interviews found these meetings were inconsistently held during the restructuring phase (p. 62).

Reconvening and Reimagining the Faculty Assessment Committee. In the Spring of 2023, the AAO reconvened the Faculty Assessment Committee. The committee at the time consisted of the CED Dean, Associate Deans, department chairs, a faculty representative from each department, and the AAO team. In the meeting, Dean Ortiz and Associate Dean Bustamante led a discussion to redefine the role and function of the AAO in response to concerns raised during the AAO Listening Tour about its efficiency and effectiveness in engaging faculty in meaningful continuous improvement discussions. As a result, the committee reaffirmed its role as an advisory board to the AAO and a liaison between the AAO and departments. It also committed to meeting twice a semester and discussed the inclusion of a CHHS representative beginning in the Fall of 2023. These meetings would function as a community of practice where faculty will be grounded in data inquiry, aiming to inform meaningful continuous improvement practices to better support our programs and serve our students.

For programs housed outside the CED, there is a one-way process of the CED providing data reports to the programs, and no consistent evidence was found that these programs were systematically or formally involved in the unit's continuous improvement process (p. 63).

CHHS Representative. In response to the CTC recommendations, the Faculty Assessment Committee membership was extended to include a representative from the CHHS credential programs. This representative is responsible for updating the three programs and collaborating with the AAO to develop meaningful continuous improvement practices, particularly aimed at enhancing support for the Social Work, SLP, and APEAA credential programs. With the support of CHHS Associate Dean Tiffanye Vargas, for this academic year, the program coordinators of the SLP program attend the Faculty Assessment Committee meetings each semester.

CHHS Engagement. In addition, we initiated an ongoing conversation between the CED and the CHHS to establish a systematic approach for greater involvement of CHHS credential programs in our unit's continuous improvement process. In <a href="December 2023">December 2023</a>, we met to discuss CTC recommendations from the 2023 CTC CED Site Visit, brainstorm ideas to enhance the involvement of CHHS credential programs in the CED continuous improvement process, and explore how the AAO can support our CHHS credential programs.

Integrating CHHS into the Exit Survey. As an immediate response to the CTC recommendations, we focused on the program's Exit Surveys. While the AAO has administered the Social Work and the APEAA Exit Surveys, SLP has administered its own exit survey. We collaboratively decided on the Exit Survey questions that would be asked of all CED and CHHS credential programs to identify trends within our credential candidates collectively and ensure that the unit head is informed of the needs of educator programs

housed outside the CED. Lastly, the AAO committed to providing each CHHS program with an advanced analysis of the survey data to inform continuous program improvement.

In summary, the insights and expertise of the CHHS credential program leadership have significantly contributed to the AAO's understanding of how to best support our CHHS credential programs, seamlessly integrating them into our unit's continuous improvement process.

### **Engagement of External Constituents**

There is not a systematic method to collect input from external constituents for the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Bilingual Authorization programs (p. 63).

District Partners Meeting. The unit is actively working on developing the collection of input from external constituents for our credential programs. As the AAO builds an inventory of available data collection methods and data sources, the unit is gradually becoming equipped to provide data collection support to our credential programs. In the meantime, we have begun to provide the unit head and our programs with data and reports of our candidates and completers that have been used to facilitate discussions with our external partners. For example, during the District Partners Meeting in Fall 2023, discussions between the Dean, leadership, and district partners were centered on data obtained from the CSU Program Completers survey. External constituents, including those involved with the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Bilingual Authorization, were invited to share their insights and feedback on the relevance of the shared data to their experiences working with our candidates. After the meeting, the unit was left with valuable insights that speak to the priorities and needs of our district partners. In addition to these efforts, Dean Ortiz has met with area Superintendents and intends to establish a team of advisors with whom she will convene annually.

LBUSD-CSULB Learning Exchange. The CSULB-Long Beach Unified School District (LBUSD) Learning Exchange is a collaborative semesterly event that brings together leadership, staff, and faculty from both organizations. The recent CSULB-LBUSD Learning Exchange, hosted by the CED on February 9, 2024, convened 87 stakeholders from the CED and LBUSD. Participants engaged in various activities, including learning about CED programs; providing input into the emerging CED Strategic Plan; discussing our mutual efforts around the implementation of culturally responsive and sustaining pedagogy across initial credential programs; and addressing the need to prepare future educators of color through the Future Black Educator (FBE) Network and The Educator of Color Pathway. In addition, there was a workgroup specifically focused on dual-language learners and elementary school literacy. This learning exchange culminated in a discussion around recent initiatives, shared challenges, and ways to enhance collaboration between the two organizations.

*Employer Pulse Survey.* Another effort currently underway is the revision of the CED Alumni and Employer Surveys. During the <u>Faculty Assessment Committee</u> meeting in February of 2024, members discussed the goals, design, and questions in these surveys, which aim to gather input from external constituents. We will collaborate with program

coordinators to distribute these surveys to advisory committees and district partners who can offer valuable input. This initiative will establish a systematic method for collecting input from external constituents, particularly benefiting the Reading and Literacy Added Authorization and Bilingual Authorization.

## Conclusion

During the 2023 CTC Site Visit, our unit was undergoing a significant transitional phase in leadership. A year later, under new Dean leadership, we are proud to report that we have the support and vision to reimagine and implement a comprehensive continuous improvement process at both the unit level and within each of our credential programs. Over the past year, we have implemented the AAO Strategic Plan, prioritized the engagement of our CHHS credential programs, reimagined the Faculty Assessment Committee, and engaged our external constituents, recognizing how invaluable their input has been in informing our continuous improvement process. Moving forward, we remain grateful for the insights gained from the accreditation process. These insights have served as a framework to ensure that the CSULB College of Education continues meeting the CTC's highest standards of quality and effectively addresses the evolving educational needs of our state.